



# Kent Academic Repository

**Meijaard, Erik, Brooks, Thomas M., Carlson, Kimberley M., Slade, Eleanor M., Garcia-Ulloa, John, Gaveau, David L. A., Lee, Janice Ser Huay, Santika, Truly, Juffe-Bignoli, Diego, Struebig, Matthew J. and others (2020) *The environmental impacts of palm oil in context*. Nature Plants, 6 . pp. 1418-1426. ISSN 2055-026X.**

## Downloaded from

<https://kar.kent.ac.uk/84676/> The University of Kent's Academic Repository KAR

## The version of record is available from

<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41477-020-00813-w>

## This document version

Author's Accepted Manuscript

## DOI for this version

## Licence for this version

UNSPECIFIED

## Additional information

## Versions of research works

### Versions of Record

If this version is the version of record, it is the same as the published version available on the publisher's web site. Cite as the published version.

### Author Accepted Manuscripts

If this document is identified as the Author Accepted Manuscript it is the version after peer review but before type setting, copy editing or publisher branding. Cite as Surname, Initial. (Year) 'Title of article'. To be published in *Title of Journal*, Volume and issue numbers [peer-reviewed accepted version]. Available at: DOI or URL (Accessed: date).

## Enquiries

If you have questions about this document contact [ResearchSupport@kent.ac.uk](mailto:ResearchSupport@kent.ac.uk). Please include the URL of the record in KAR. If you believe that your, or a third party's rights have been compromised through this document please see our [Take Down policy](https://www.kent.ac.uk/guides/kar-the-kent-academic-repository#policies) (available from <https://www.kent.ac.uk/guides/kar-the-kent-academic-repository#policies>).

# 1 The environmental impacts of palm oil in 2 context

3 Erik Meijaard<sup>1,2,3\*</sup>, Thomas Brooks<sup>4,5,6</sup>, Kimberly M. Carlson<sup>7,8</sup>, Eleanor M. Slade<sup>9</sup>, John Garcia Ulloa<sup>10</sup>,  
4 David L.A. Gaveau<sup>11</sup>, Janice Ser Huay Lee<sup>9</sup>, Truly Santika<sup>1,2</sup>, Diego Juffe-Bignoli<sup>2,12</sup>, Matthew J.  
5 Struebig<sup>2</sup>, Serge A. Wich<sup>13,14</sup>, Marc Ancrenaz<sup>1,15</sup>, Lian Pin Koh<sup>16</sup>, Nadine Zamira<sup>17</sup>, Jesse. F. Abrams<sup>18,19</sup>,  
6 Herbert H.T. Prins<sup>20</sup>, Cyriaque N. Sendashonga<sup>21</sup>, Daniel Murdiyarto<sup>10,22</sup>, Paul R. Furumo<sup>23</sup>, Nicholas  
7 Macfarlane<sup>4</sup>, Rachel Hoffmann<sup>24</sup>, Marcos Persio<sup>25</sup>, Adrià Descals<sup>26</sup>, Zoltan Szantoi<sup>27,28</sup>, Douglas Sheil<sup>29</sup>

8 <sup>1</sup> Borneo Futures, Bandar Seri Begawan, Brunei Darussalam.

9 <sup>2</sup> Durrell Institute of Conservation and Ecology, University of Kent, Canterbury, UK.

10 <sup>3</sup> School of Biological Sciences, University of Queensland, St Lucia, Australia.

11 <sup>4</sup> Science and Knowledge Unit, IUCN, Gland, Switzerland.

12 <sup>5</sup> World Agroforestry Center (ICRAF), University of The Philippines Los Baños, Laguna, Philippines.

13 <sup>6</sup> Institute for Marine & Antarctic Studies, University of Tasmania, Hobart, Australia.

14 <sup>7</sup> Department of Natural Resources and Environmental Management, the University of Hawai'i at  
15 Mānoa, HI, USA.

16 <sup>8</sup> Department of Environmental Studies, New York University, New York, NY, USA.

17 <sup>9</sup> Asian School of the Environment, Nanyang Technological University of Singapore, Singapore.

18 <sup>10</sup> Department of Environmental Systems Science, ETH Zürich, Zürich, Switzerland.

19 <sup>11</sup> Center for International Forestry Research, Bogor, Indonesia.

20 <sup>12</sup> UN Environment Programme World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC), Cambridge,  
21 UK.

22 <sup>13</sup> School of Biological and Environmental Sciences, Liverpool John Moores University, Liverpool, UK.

23 <sup>14</sup> Institute for Biodiversity and Ecosystem Dynamics, University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam, The  
24 Netherlands.

25 <sup>15</sup> Kinabatangan Orang-Utan Conservation Programme, Kota Kinabalu, Sabah, Malaysia.

26 <sup>16</sup> Department of Biological Sciences, National University of Singapore, Singapore.

27 <sup>17</sup> Rainforest Alliance, Washington, DC, USA.

28 <sup>18</sup> Department of Ecological Dynamics, Leibniz Institute for Zoo and Wildlife Research, Berlin,  
29 Germany.

30 <sup>19</sup> Global Systems Institute and Institute for Data Science and Artificial Intelligence, University of  
31 Exeter, Exeter, United Kingdom.

32 <sup>20</sup> Animal Sciences Group, Wageningen University, the Netherlands.

33 <sup>21</sup> IUCN Policy and Programme Group, IUCN, Gland, Switzerland.

34 <sup>22</sup> Department of Geophysics and Meteorology, IPB University, Bogor, Indonesia.

35 <sup>23</sup> Earth System Science, Stanford University, CA, USA.

36 <sup>24</sup> Department of Veterinary Medicine, University of Cambridge, UK.

37 <sup>25</sup> Instituto de Ciências Biológicas, Universidade Federal do Pará, Belém, Brazil.

38 <sup>26</sup> Centre de Recerca Ecològica i Aplicacions Forestals, Cerdanyola del Vallès, Barcelona, Spain.

39 <sup>27</sup> European Commission, Joint Research Centre, Ispra, Italy.

40 <sup>28</sup> Stellenbosch University, Stellenbosch, South Africa.

41 <sup>29</sup> Department of Ecology and Natural Resource Management, Norwegian University of Life Sciences,  
42 Ås, Norway.

43 \*e-mail: [emeijaard@gmail.com](mailto:emeijaard@gmail.com)

44 **Abstract**

45 Delivering the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) requires balancing demands on land between  
46 agriculture (SDG 2) and biodiversity (SDG 15). The production of vegetable oils, and in particular  
47 palm oil, illustrates these competing demands and trade-offs. Palm oil accounts for 40%<sup>1</sup> of the  
48 current global annual demand for vegetable oil as food, animal feed, and fuel (210 million tons<sup>2</sup>  
49 (Mt)), but planted oil palm covers less than 5-5.5%<sup>3</sup> of total global oil crop area (ca. 425 Mha)<sup>4</sup>, due  
50 to oil palm's relatively high yields<sup>5</sup>. Recent oil palm expansion in forested regions of Borneo,  
51 Sumatra, and the Malay Peninsula, where >90% of global palm oil is produced<sup>5</sup>, has led to substantial  
52 concern around oil palm's role in deforestation. Oil palm expansion's direct contribution to regional  
53 tropical deforestation varies widely, ranging from 3% in West Africa to 47% in Malaysia<sup>6</sup>. Oil palm is  
54 also implicated in peatland draining and burning in Southeast Asia. Documented negative  
55 environmental impacts from such expansion include biodiversity declines, greenhouse gas  
56 emissions, and air pollution. However, oil palm generally produces more oil per area than other oil  
57 crops<sup>7</sup>, is often economically viable in sites unsuitable for most other crops, and generates  
58 considerable wealth for at least some actors<sup>8</sup>. Global demand for vegetable oils is projected to  
59 increase by 46% by 2050<sup>9</sup>. Meeting this demand through additional expansion of oil palm versus  
60 other vegetable oil crops will lead to substantial differential effects on biodiversity, food security,  
61 climate change, land degradation, and livelihoods. Our review highlights that, although substantial  
62 gaps remain in our understanding of the relationship between the environmental, socio-cultural and  
63 economic impacts of oil palm, and the scope, stringency and effectiveness of initiatives to address  
64 these, there has been little research into the impacts and trade-offs of other vegetable oil crops.  
65 Greater research attention needs to be given to investigating the impacts of palm oil production  
66 compared to alternatives for the trade-offs to be assessed at a global scale.

67 Over the past 25 years, global oil crops have expanded rapidly, with major impacts on land use<sup>9</sup>. The  
68 land used for growing oil crops grew from 170 million ha (Mha) in 1961 to 425 Mha in 2017<sup>4</sup> or ~30%  
69 of all cropland world-wide<sup>10</sup>. Oil palm, soy, and rapeseed together account for >80% of all vegetable  
70 oil production with cotton, groundnuts, sunflower, olive, and coconut comprising most of the  
71 remainder (Table 1, Figure 1). These crops, including soy (125 Mha planted area<sup>4</sup>) and maize (197  
72 Mha planted area<sup>4</sup>), are also used as animal feed and other products.

73 Oil palm is the most rapidly expanding oil crop. This palm originates from equatorial Africa where it  
74 has been cultivated for millennia, but it is now widely grown in Southeast Asia. Between 2008 and  
75 2017, oil palm expanded globally at an average rate of 0.7 Mha per year<sup>4</sup>, and palm oil is the leading  
76 and cheapest edible oil in much of Asia and Africa. While it has been estimated that palm oil is an  
77 ingredient in 43% of products found in British supermarkets<sup>11</sup>, we lack comparable studies for the  
78 prevalence of other oils.

79 As a wild plant, the oil palm is a colonising species that establishes in open areas. Cultivated palms  
80 are commonly planted as monocultures, although the tree is also used in mixed, small-scale and  
81 agroforestry settings. To maximize photosynthetic capacity and fruit yields, oil palm requires a warm  
82 and wet climate, high solar radiation, and high humidity. It is thus most productive in the humid  
83 tropics, while other oil crops, except coconut, grow primarily in subtropical and temperate regions  
84 (Table 1). Moreover, because oil palm tolerates many soils including deep peat and sandy substrates,  
85 it is often profitable in locations where few other commodity crops are viable. The highest yields  
86 from planted oil palm have been reported in Southeast Asia<sup>5</sup>. Yields are generally lower in Africa<sup>12</sup>  
87 and the Neotropics<sup>5</sup>, likely reflecting differences in climatic conditions including humidity and cloud  
88 cover<sup>12</sup>, as well as management, occurrence of pests and diseases, and planting stock<sup>13</sup>.

89 Palm oil is controversial due to its social and environmental impacts and opportunities. Loss of  
90 natural habitats, reduction in woody biomass, and peatland drainage that occur during site

91 preparation are the main direct environmental impacts from oil palm development<sup>14</sup>. Such  
92 conversion typically reduces biodiversity and water quality and increases greenhouse gas emissions,  
93 and, when fire is used, smoke and haze<sup>5,15</sup>. Industrial oil palm expansion by large multi-national and  
94 national companies is also often associated with social problems, such as land grabbing and conflicts,  
95 labour exploitation, social inequity<sup>16</sup> and declines in village-level well-being<sup>17</sup>. In producer countries,  
96 oil palm is a valued crop that brings economic development to regions with few alternative  
97 agricultural development options<sup>8</sup>, and generates substantial average livelihood improvements  
98 when smallholder farmers adopt oil palm<sup>18</sup>. Here we review the current understanding of the  
99 environmental impacts from oil palm cultivation and assess what we know about other oil crops in  
100 comparison. Our focus is on biodiversity implications and the environmental aspects of  
101 sustainability, and we acknowledge the importance of considering these alongside socio-cultural,  
102 political, and economic outcomes.

### 103 **DEFORESTATION AND OIL PALM EXPANSION**

104 A remote sensing assessment found that oil palm plantations covered at least 19.5 Mha globally in  
105 2019 (Figure 2), of which an estimated 67.2% were industrial-scale plantings and the remainder  
106 smallholders<sup>3</sup>. With 17.5 Mha, Southeast Asia has the largest area under production, followed by  
107 South and Central America (1.31 Mha), Africa (0.58 Mha) and the Pacific (0.14 Mha). However, the  
108 actual area under oil palm production could be 10–20% greater than the area detected from satellite  
109 imagery, i.e. 21.5–23.4 Mha, because young plantations (< ca. 3 years), open-canopy plantations, or  
110 mixed-species agroforests were omitted<sup>3</sup>. Estimates suggest that the proportion of oil palm area  
111 under smallholder cultivation (typically less than 50 ha of land per family<sup>19</sup>) varies from 30–60% in  
112 parts of Malaysia and Indonesia<sup>17</sup> to 94% in Nigeria<sup>5</sup>.

113 The overall contribution of oil palm expansion to deforestation varies widely and depends in part on  
114 assessment scope (temporal, spatial) and methods. We reviewed 23 studies that reported land use

115 or land cover change involving oil palm (Table S1 and S2). In Malaysian Borneo, oil palm was an  
116 important contributor to overall deforestation<sup>20</sup>. Here, new plantations accounted for 50% of  
117 deforestation from 1972 to 2015 when using a 5-year cut-off to link deforestation and oil palm  
118 development<sup>21</sup> (Figure 3, Figure S2, Table S3). In contrast, one global sample-based study suggested  
119 that between 2000 and 2013, just 0.2% of global deforestation in “Intact Forest Landscapes” was  
120 caused by oil palm development<sup>22</sup>.

121 The degree to which oil palm expansion has replaced forests (defined as naturally regenerating  
122 closed canopy forests) varies with context. From 1972 to 2015, around 46% of new plantations  
123 expanded into forest, with the remainder replacing croplands, pasturelands, scrublands (including  
124 secondary forest regrowth), and other land uses<sup>5</sup>. Individual studies reported forest clearance  
125 ranging from 68% of tracked oil palm expansion in Malaysia and 44% in the Peruvian Amazon, to just  
126 5–6% in West Africa, Central America, and South America excluding Peru (Figure 3). In general, oil  
127 palm expansion in the Neotropics is characterized by the conversion of previously cleared lands  
128 instead of forests<sup>23,24</sup>, although the extent to which oil palm displaces other land uses into forests  
129 remains uncertain. In Indonesia and Malaysian Borneo, industrial plantation expansion and  
130 associated deforestation have declined since ca. 2011<sup>6,25</sup>. However, smallholder plantings developed  
131 to support demand by industrial palm oil mills may be increasing. To date, only two studies have  
132 clearly differentiated between forest clearing by smallholders and industrial plantations (Table S2).  
133 In Peru, 30% of smallholder plantings resulted in deforestation<sup>26</sup>, while in Sumatra, Indonesia 39% of  
134 smallholder expansion was into forest<sup>27</sup>. While we still lack broader understanding of the  
135 deforestation impacts of smallholders<sup>27</sup>, recent studies from Indonesian Borneo show that like  
136 industrial actors, smallholders sometimes convert fragile ecosystems such as tropical peatlands into  
137 oil palm plantations<sup>28</sup>. Other oil crops have not yet been mapped globally with similar levels of  
138 accuracy, precluding detailed assessments and comparisons.

### 139 **OIL PALM’S DIRECT IMPACTS ON SPECIES**

140 The International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN) Red List of Threatened Species<sup>29</sup>  
141 documents 321 species for which oil palm is a reported threat, significantly more than for other oil  
142 crops (Figure 4, Table 1). Species threatened by oil palm made up 3.5% of the taxa threatened by  
143 annual and perennial non-timber crops (9,088 species) and 1.2% of all globally threatened taxa  
144 (27,159 species) in 2019 (Supplementary Materials, Table S4). These species include orangutans  
145 *Pongo* spp., gibbons *Hylobates* spp. and the tiger *Panthera tigris*. Species threat lists, however, are  
146 incomplete as most plant groups have not been comprehensively assessed, and the focus of threat  
147 studies may be biased toward certain oil crops. For example, perennial crops (oil palm, coconut,  
148 olive) might be more easily identified as a threat to a species than annual crops, because perennial  
149 crops facilitate long-term studies that are more difficult with annual crops that may not be planted  
150 every year. Also, the IUCN Red List focuses on threats in the recent past, and is thus biased toward  
151 crops with recent rapid expansion. Better information is needed for all oil crops about where they  
152 are grown, and how their expansion has affected and could affect natural and semi-natural  
153 ecosystems and biodiversity. We note that because coconut is primarily grown in tropical island  
154 nations it stands out as a particular threat for rare and endemic species with small ranges<sup>30</sup> (Table 1).

155 Oil palm plantations contain lower species diversity and abundance for most taxonomic groups  
156 when compared to natural forest<sup>31,32</sup>. Plant diversity in some plantations is less than 1% of that in  
157 natural forests<sup>31</sup>, but because oil palm is perennial, associated plant diversity may exceed that of  
158 annual oil crops (Table 1). One study found 298 plant species in the oil palm undergrowth<sup>33</sup>, and  
159 another found 16 species of fern on oil palm trunks<sup>34</sup>, while a meta-analysis of plant diversity in a  
160 range of annual crops, including oil crops, found between one and 15 associated plant species<sup>35</sup>.

161 Plant diversity in any oil croplands also depends on management choices such as tillage, weeding  
162 and the use of herbicides or other chemicals.

163 Recorded mammal diversity in oil palm is 47–90% lower than in natural forest<sup>36,37</sup>, and strongly  
164 depends on the proximity of natural forests. Oil palm plantations generally exclude forest specialist



165 species<sup>38,39</sup>, which are often those species of greatest conservation importance. For example, forest-  
166 dependent gibbons (Hylobatidae) cannot survive in stands of monocultural oil palm, but can make  
167 use of interspersed forest fragments within an oil palm matrix<sup>31</sup>. Some species, although unable to  
168 survive solely in oil palm, will utilise plantations. For instance, planted oil palm in Malaysian Borneo  
169 supported 22 of the 63 mammal species found in forest habitats<sup>36</sup>, and 31 of 130 bird species<sup>40</sup>, most  
170 of them relatively common species. Oil palm in Guatemala and Brazil supported 23 and 58 bird  
171 species, respectively<sup>39,41</sup>, while 12 species of snakes were found in a Nigerian oil palm plantation<sup>42</sup>.  
172 Various species will enter plantations to feed on oil palm fruit, including Palm-nut Vultures  
173 *Gypohierax angolensis*<sup>43</sup> and Chimpanzee *Pan troglodytes*<sup>43</sup> in Africa and porcupines (Hystricidae),  
174 civets (Viverridae), macaques (Cercopithecidae), elephants (Elephantidae) and orangutans in  
175 Southeast Asia<sup>44</sup>. The highest diversity of animal species in oil palm areas, however, is generally  
176 found in the wider landscape that includes remnant patches of native vegetation<sup>45,46</sup>. Factors that  
177 are likely to positively influence biodiversity values in both industrial-scale and smallholder  
178 plantations include higher landscape heterogeneity, the presence of large forest patches and  
179 connectivity among these<sup>47</sup>, and the plant diversity and structure of undergrowth vegetation. For  
180 example, in palm areas where there is systematic cattle grazing, bird and dung beetle abundance  
181 and diversity increase<sup>48,49</sup>.

182 Oil palm cultivation involves the introduction and spread of invasive species including the oil palm  
183 itself (noted in Madagascar and Brazil's Atlantic Forests<sup>50</sup>), as well as non-native cover crops and  
184 nitrogen-fixing plants (e.g., *Mucuna bracteata* or *Calopogonium caeruleum*). Similarly, management  
185 of oil palm plantations can increase the local abundance of species such as Barn Owls *Tyto alba*,  
186 introduced into plantations to control rodents<sup>51</sup>. Oil palm plantations also support pests such as the  
187 Black Rat *Rattus rattus*, pigs *Sus* spp., and beetles such as the Asiatic Rhinoceros Beetle *Oryctes*  
188 *rhinoceros* and the Red Palm Weevil *Rhynchophorus ferrugineus*<sup>52</sup>. Such species can impact palm oil  
189 production negatively, for example in reducing oil palm yields through damage to the palm or fruit

190 predation<sup>53</sup>. They also have a range of local effects, both positive and negative for biodiversity,  
191 including animals that prey on them, such as snakes, owls, monkeys and cats<sup>54</sup>, while the extra food  
192 provided by oil palm fruits can increase pig populations resulting in reduced seedling recruitment in  
193 forests neighbouring oil palm<sup>55</sup>.

194 Management within oil palm areas to retain riparian reserves and other set-asides containing  
195 natural forest may contribute to pollination and pest control within the plantation, although they  
196 may also harbour pests and disease<sup>56</sup>. Studies to date suggest overall limited, or neutral, effects of  
197 such set-asides on pest control services, spill over of pest species, or oil palm yield<sup>57</sup>. There are also  
198 plenty of unknowns, for example, the African beetle *Elaiadobius kamerunicus* has been introduced  
199 as an effective oil palm pollinator and is now widely naturalised in Southeast Asia and America  
200 where it also persists in native vegetation and visits the inflorescences of native palms but its  
201 impacts, if any, are unexamined (DS pers. obs.). No systematic analysis has been conducted to assess  
202 the impact of non-native and invasive species associated with other oil crops.

203 Smallholder plantations tend to be smaller and more heterogeneous than industrial developments,  
204 which potentially benefits wildlife, but this remains poorly studied<sup>32</sup>. A handful of studies indicate  
205 that smallholdings support a similar number of, or slightly more, bird and mammal species than  
206 industrial plantations, e.g. <sup>58</sup>. However, species in smallholder plantations may be more exposed to  
207 other pressures, such as hunting, when compared to industrial plantations<sup>58</sup>.

## 208 **OTHER ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS**

209 Oil palm plantations have a predominantly negative net effect on ecosystem functions when  
210 compared to primary, selectively logged or secondary forest<sup>15</sup>. The clearance of forests and drainage  
211 of peatlands for oil palm emits substantial carbon dioxide<sup>59</sup>. Oil palms can maintain high rates of  
212 carbon uptake<sup>60</sup> and their oil can potentially be used to substitute fossil fuels, and thus contribute  
213 towards sustainable energy (SDG 7) and climate change response (SDG 13). Yet, biofuel from oil

214 palm cannot compensate for the carbon released when forests are cleared and peatlands drained  
215 over short or medium time-scales (<100 years)<sup>61</sup>. Moreover, the carbon opportunity cost of oil palm,  
216 which reflects the land's opportunity to store carbon if it is not used for agriculture, is not very  
217 different from annual vegetable oil crops<sup>61</sup> (Table 1).

218 Oil palm plantations, and the production of palm oil, can also be sources of methane<sup>62</sup> and nitrous  
219 oxide<sup>63</sup>, both potent greenhouse gases that contribute further to climate change, although the  
220 former is sometimes used as biogas, reducing net greenhouse gas release<sup>64</sup>. Other emissions  
221 associated with oil palm development include elevated isoprene production by palm trees, which  
222 influences atmospheric chemistry, cloud cover and rainfall, although how this affects the  
223 environment remains unclear<sup>65</sup>. In addition, there is some evidence that emissions of other organic  
224 compounds, e.g., estragole and toluene<sup>66</sup>, are also higher in oil palm plantations than in forest, but  
225 these emissions appear minor compared to isoprene<sup>67</sup>.

226 Forest loss and land use conversion to oil palm impact the local and regional climate, although the  
227 extent of these impacts remains debated<sup>68</sup>. For example, increased temperatures and reduced  
228 rainfall recorded over Borneo since the mid-1970s are thought to relate to the island's declining  
229 forest cover which is partly due to the expansion of oil palm, with climate changes being greater in  
230 areas where forest losses were higher<sup>69</sup>. Indeed, oil palm plantations tend to be hotter, drier and  
231 less shaded than forests due to their less dense canopy, and often have higher evapotranspiration  
232 rates than forests<sup>70</sup>. A drier hotter climate increases the risk of fire and concomitant smoke  
233 pollution, especially in peat ecosystems<sup>71</sup>. In addition to human health consequences (e.g.,  
234 respiratory diseases, conjunctivitis), such fires can impact wildlife<sup>72</sup> and atmospheric processes. For  
235 example, aerosols from fires can scatter solar radiation, disrupt evaporation, and promote drought<sup>68</sup>.  
236 Few of these relationships are well-studied.

237 Conversion of natural forests to oil palm plantations increases run-off and sediment export due to  
238 loss or reduction of riparian buffers, reduced ground cover, and dense road networks<sup>73</sup>. Streams  
239 flowing through plantations tend to be warmer, shallower, sandier, more turbid, and to have  
240 reduced abundances of aquatic species such as dragonflies (Anisoptera) than streams in forested  
241 areas<sup>74</sup>. Fertilizers, pesticides, and other chemicals used on plantations also impact water quality and  
242 aquatic habitats<sup>75</sup>. The effluent from most modern mills is minimized, but release into local rivers  
243 has caused negative impacts to people and to aquatic and marine ecosystems<sup>76</sup>. Some hydrological  
244 impacts may be viewed as positive: for example, construction of flood-control channels and  
245 sedimentation ponds for palm oil effluent can benefit some water birds<sup>77</sup>.

246 Drainage of peatlands and other wetlands to establish oil palm disrupts hydrological cycles,  
247 potentially impacting neighbouring forests and other habitats<sup>78</sup>. The protection and restoration of  
248 riparian buffers and reserves within oil palm plantations is therefore key to preserving water quality,  
249 with recent research also showing the importance of these landscape features for biodiversity and  
250 ecosystem function<sup>79</sup>. Riparian reserve widths required by law in many tropical countries (20–50 m  
251 on each bank) can support substantial levels of biodiversity, maintain hydrological functioning, and  
252 improve habitat connectivity and permeability for some species within oil palm<sup>79</sup>. However, research  
253 is urgently needed regarding minimum buffer width and size requirements under different contexts,  
254 for different taxa, and for different oil crops.

## 255 **THE FUTURE OF OIL PALM**

256 Demand for agricultural commodities is growing. Some predict that palm oil production will  
257 accelerate across tropical Africa<sup>80</sup>. However, due to current socio-cultural, technical, political and  
258 ecological constraints only around one-tenth of the potential 51 million ha in the five main  
259 producing countries in tropical Africa is likely to be profitably developed in the near future<sup>13</sup>,  
260 although this might change as technological, financial and governance conditions improve<sup>81</sup>. The

261 expansion of oil palm in the Neotropics is also uncertain because of greater challenges the sector  
262 faces compared to Southeast Asia, including lower yields, high labour costs, volatile socio-political  
263 contexts, and high investment costs<sup>5</sup>. Although the importance of these factors varies from country  
264 to country, in general the expansion of the palm oil industry in the Americas depends heavily on  
265 economic incentives and policies, and access to international markets.

266 Meeting the growing demand for palm oil, while adhering to new zero deforestation policies<sup>82</sup>, and  
267 consumer pressure to be more sustainable, will likely require a combination of approaches, including  
268 increasing yields in existing production areas especially those managed by smallholders<sup>9</sup>, and  
269 planting in deforested areas and degraded open ecosystems such as man-made pastures<sup>60</sup>. These  
270 strategies span a land-sparing and land-sharing continuum, with higher-yielding oil palm cultivation  
271 sparing land and perhaps reducing overall impacts on biodiversity<sup>38</sup>, although intermediate  
272 strategies on the sparing-sharing continuum may be better at meeting broader societal goals<sup>83</sup>.  
273 Irrespective of the optimal strategy, replanting with high-yielding palms or implementing land  
274 sharing agroforestry techniques are challenging for smallholders, who often lack resources and  
275 technical knowledge, and may not be able to access improved varieties required to increase yields<sup>84</sup>.  
276 In such situations, provision of technical support from government agencies, non-government  
277 organisations or private companies may help smallholders choose intensification over clearing more  
278 land to increase palm oil production<sup>12</sup>.

279 The extent to which biofuel demand by international markets will drive oil palm expansion remains  
280 unclear. There is resistance from environmental non-governmental organizations and governments,  
281 including the European Union, the second-largest palm oil importer after India<sup>5</sup>, to the use of palm  
282 oil as a biofuel to replace fossil fuels and meet climate change mitigation goals. Such resistance is  
283 related to the high CO<sub>2</sub>-emissions from oil palm-driven deforestation and associated peatland  
284 development<sup>85</sup>. Nonetheless, if oil palm is developed on low carbon stock lands, estimates suggest it  
285 may have lower carbon emissions per unit of energy produced than other oil crops like European

286 rapeseed<sup>86</sup>. Consistent and comparable information on the extent and consequences of other oil  
287 crops is urgently required to encourage more efficient land use<sup>61</sup>.

## 288 **GOVERNANCE OPTIONS**

289 Efforts to address the impacts of oil palm cultivation and palm oil trade have been the focus of  
290 several initiatives. For example, the two main producer countries have set up the Malaysian  
291 Sustainable Palm Oil and Indonesian Sustainable Palm Oil certification schemes, which mandate that  
292 oil palm producers comply with a set of practices meant to ensure social and environmentally  
293 responsible production. International concerns related to deforestation have been addressed  
294 through the High Carbon Stock and High Conservation Value approaches<sup>87</sup>, which are methodologies  
295 that guide identification and protection of lands with relatively intact forest or value for biodiversity,  
296 ecosystem services, livelihoods and cultural identity. These frameworks are used by producers to  
297 meet the requirements of palm oil sustainability initiatives including certification under the  
298 Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO) standard. This standard was recently expanded to  
299 include protection, management, and restoration of riparian areas within certified plantations, a  
300 prohibition on new planting on peat, and compliance with the standard is now being used to meet  
301 corporate zero-deforestation commitments<sup>5</sup>. There is evidence for positive impacts of RSPO  
302 certification achieved through improved management practices, including changes in agrochemical  
303 use, improved forest protection, and reduced fires and biodiversity losses, although these effects  
304 remain small<sup>88,89</sup>.

305 Many producers and traders of palm oil have now committed to “zero deforestation”. A 2017 cross-  
306 commodity survey<sup>90</sup> found that companies in the palm oil sector have the highest proportion of no-  
307 deforestation commitments across four commodity supply chains (palm oil, soy, timber and cattle)  
308 linked to global deforestation. Although most of these commitments have been made by retailers  
309 and manufacturers<sup>90</sup>, oil palm growers have also made such pledges. In 2018, 41 of the 50 palm oil

310 producers with the largest market capitalization and land areas had committed to address  
311 deforestation, with 29 of them pledging to adhere to zero deforestation practices<sup>91</sup>. These  
312 commitments have been identified as a factor in declining expansion of oil palm in Malaysia and  
313 Indonesia<sup>6,25</sup>, although low commodity prices have likely also contributed<sup>6</sup>. Such private supply chain  
314 initiatives like certification and zero-deforestation commitments may be most effective in reducing  
315 environmental impacts when leveraged with public and institutional support such as plantation  
316 moratoria for certain areas and national low-carbon rural development strategies<sup>92</sup>, as has been  
317 demonstrated, for example, in Brazilian soy production<sup>93</sup>.

### 318 **LAND USE TRADE-OFFS AMONG VEGETABLE OILS**

319 While the environmental impacts of oil palm on natural ecosystems are overwhelmingly negative,  
320 such impacts also need to be considered in relation to other land uses, including competing  
321 vegetable oil commodities, all of which have their own implications for biodiversity, carbon  
322 emissions and other environmental dynamics (Table 1). Global vegetable oil production is expected  
323 to expand at around 1.5% per year between 2017 and 2027<sup>94</sup>, while use is projected to expand at  
324 1.7% per year globally between 2013 and 2050 from a baseline of 165 million tons (Mt), including for  
325 use in food, feed and biofuel<sup>9</sup>. Unless demand for oil decelerates, this implies an additional  
326 production of an average of 3.86 Mt of vegetable oil per year. If this production was delivered by oil  
327 palm alone, yielding ca. 4 tons of crude palm oil per ha<sup>5,7</sup>, 31.3 Mha of additional vegetable oil  
328 production land would be needed between 2020 and 2050. If, the addition instead all came from  
329 soy, yielding about 0.7 tons of oil per ha<sup>9</sup>, 179 Mha of extra land, or nearly six times as much, would  
330 be required. This simple calculation glosses over nuances of substitutability<sup>95</sup> or differential yield  
331 increases among crops, but illustrates the magnitude of differences between land needed by oil  
332 palm and other oil crops<sup>96</sup>.

333 Understanding impacts is, however, not just a matter of comparing current and projected  
334 distributions and yields of different crops and thus land needs, but also requires clarifying how each  
335 hectare of land converted to an oil crop impacts both the environment and people. For example, soy  
336 is known to have a large negative impact on biodiversity, with few vertebrates occurring in this  
337 annual monoculture crop<sup>97</sup>, and is responsible for loss of high biodiversity savanna and forest  
338 ecosystems in South America<sup>98</sup>. Thus, sustainable development, including simultaneous delivery of  
339 SDGs 2 on agriculture and 15 on biodiversity (alongside contributions to SDG 7 on energy and SDG  
340 13 on climate), must consider the wider trade-offs posed by sourcing global vegetable oils<sup>99</sup>. One key  
341 uncertainty is the extent to which demand can be met by increasing yields within established  
342 vegetable oil croplands. An additional uncertainty is whether other options, for example microalgal-  
343 derived lipids<sup>100</sup>, may soon offer viable alternatives to meet demand for biofuel.

#### 344 **THE WAY FORWARD**

345 The expansion of oil palm has had large negative environmental impacts and continues to cause  
346 deforestation in some regions. Nevertheless, oil palm contributes to economic development<sup>5</sup>, has  
347 improved welfare for at least some people<sup>17</sup>, and can be consistent with at least some conservation  
348 goals especially when compared to other oil crops<sup>81</sup>. There remain substantial gaps in our  
349 understanding of oil palm and the interaction between environmental, socio-cultural and economic  
350 impacts of the crop, and the scope, stringency and effectiveness of governance initiatives to address  
351 these<sup>5</sup>. None of these concerns and trade-offs are unique to oil palm: they also apply to other  
352 vegetable oil crops<sup>30,98</sup>, as well as other agricultural products<sup>101</sup>. Indeed, all land uses and not just  
353 those in the tropics have impacts on their environment<sup>8</sup>, that can either be prevented or restored<sup>102</sup>.  
354 Pressure on the palm oil industry has, however, apparently resulted in more research on the impacts  
355 of palm oil production compared to other oils resulting in an urgent need to better study these  
356 alternatives.



357 In a world with finite land and growing demands, we must consider global demands for food, fuel  
358 and industrial uses hand-in-hand with environmental conservation objectives. Oil palm's high yields  
359 mean that it requires less land to meet global oil demand than other oil crops. However, minimising  
360 overall vegetable oil crop impacts requires evaluation for their past, current and projected  
361 distribution and impacts, and review of their yields and global trade and uses. This information is  
362 needed to enable better planning and governance of land use for all oil crops, matching risks and  
363 opportunities with local conditions and realities, and to optimize the simultaneous delivery of the  
364 SDGs.

### 365 LITERATURE CITED

- 366 1 USDA. Oil Seeds: World Markets and Trade. November 2019. (Foreign Agricultural Service,  
367 United States Department of Agriculture, Washington, DC, 2019).
- 368 2 USDA-FAS. Oilseeds: World Markets and Trade. Circular Series FOP 8-10 August. (United  
369 States Department of Agriculture Foreign Agricultural Service, Washington, DC, 2010).
- 370 3 Descals, A. *et al.* High-resolution global map of smallholder and industrial closed-canopy oil  
371 palm plantations. Preprint at <https://essd.copernicus.org/preprints/essd-2020-159/>.  
372 doi:10.5194/essd-2020-159 (2020).
- 373 4 FAOSTAT. Food and Agriculture Data. <http://www.fao.org/faostat/en/#home>. (Food and  
374 Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Rome, Italy, 2019).
- 375 5 Meijaard, E. *et al.* *Oil Palm and Biodiversity – A Situation Analysis*. DOI:  
376 10.2305/IUCN.CH.2018.11.en. (IUCN Oil Palm Task Force, 2018).
- 377 6 Gaveau, D. L. A. *et al.* Rise and fall of forest loss and industrial plantations in Borneo (2000–  
378 2017). *Cons. Lett.* **0**, e12622, doi:10.1111/conl.12622 (2019).
- 379 7 Johnston, M., Foley, J. A., Holloway, T., Kucharik, C. & Monfreda, C. Resetting global  
380 expectations from agricultural biofuels. *Env. Res. Lett.* **4**, 014004, doi:10.1088/1748-  
381 9326/4/1/014004 (2009).
- 382 8 Meijaard, E. & Sheil, D. The Moral Minefield of Ethical Oil Palm and Sustainable  
383 Development. *Front. Forests Glob. Change* **2**, doi:10.3389/ffgc.2019.00022 (2019).
- 384 9 Byerlee, D., Falcon, W. P. & Naylor, R. L. *The Tropical Oil Crop Revolution: Food, Feed, Fuel,*  
385 *and Forests*. (Oxford University Press, 2017).
- 386 10 Ramankutty, N. *et al.* Trends in Global Agricultural Land Use: Implications for Environmental  
387 Health and Food Security. *Ann. Rev. Plant Biol.* **69**, 789-815, doi:10.1146/annurev-arplant-  
388 042817-040256 (2018).
- 389 11 Independent. The guilty secrets of palm oil: Are you unwittingly contributing to the  
390 devastation of the rain forests?. [https://www.independent.co.uk/environment/the-guilty-](https://www.independent.co.uk/environment/the-guilty-secrets-of-palm-oil-are-you-unwittingly-contributing-to-the-devastation-of-the-rain-1676218.html)  
391 [secrets-of-palm-oil-are-you-unwittingly-contributing-to-the-devastation-of-the-rain-](https://www.independent.co.uk/environment/the-guilty-secrets-of-palm-oil-are-you-unwittingly-contributing-to-the-devastation-of-the-rain-1676218.html)  
392 [1676218.html](https://www.independent.co.uk/environment/the-guilty-secrets-of-palm-oil-are-you-unwittingly-contributing-to-the-devastation-of-the-rain-1676218.html). (2009).
- 393 12 Woittiez, L. S., van Wijk, M. T., Slingerland, M., van Noordwijk, M. & Giller, K. E. Yield gaps in  
394 oil palm: A quantitative review of contributing factors. *Europ. J. Agron.* **83**, 57-77,  
395 doi:10.1016/j.eja.2016.11.002 (2017).

396 13 Feintrenie, L., Gazull, L., Goulaouic, R. & Miaro III, L. Spatialized production models for  
397 sustainable palm oil in Central Africa: Choices and potentials. Presented at Scaling Up  
398 Responsible Land Governance. Annual World Bank Conference on Land and Poverty,  
399 Washington DC, March 14-18, 2016. (2016).

400 14 Sheil, D. *et al.* The impacts and opportunities of oil palm in Southeast Asia. What do we  
401 know and what do we need to know? *CIFOR Occ. Paper*, no. 51 (2009).

402 15 Dislich, C. *et al.* A review of the ecosystem functions in oil palm plantations, using forests as  
403 a reference system. *Biol. Rev.* **92**, 1539-1569, doi:10.1111/brv.12295 (2017).

404 16 Li, T., M. *Evidence-based options for advancing social equity in Indonesian palm oil:  
405 Implications for research, policy and advocacy.* (Center for International Forestry Research  
406 (CIFOR), 2018).

407 17 Santika, T. *et al.* Does oil palm agriculture help alleviate poverty? A multidimensional  
408 counterfactual assessment of oil palm development in Indonesia. *World Dev.* **120**, 105-117,  
409 doi:10.1016/j.worlddev.2019.04.012 (2019).

410 18 Krishna, V., Euler, M., Siregar, H. & Qaim, M. Differential livelihood impacts of oil palm  
411 expansion in Indonesia. *Agric. Econ.* **48**, 639-653, doi:10.1111/agec.12363 (2017).

412 19 RSPO Smallholders Task Force. Smallholders. Retrieved from  
413 <https://rspo.org/smallholders#definition>. (2012).

414 20 Gaveau, D. L. A. *et al.* Four decades of forest persistence, loss and logging on Borneo. *PLOS*  
415 *ONE* **9**, e101654, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0101654 (2014).

416 21 Gaveau, D. L. A. *et al.* Rapid conversions and avoided deforestation: examining four decades  
417 of industrial plantation expansion in Borneo. *Sci. Rep.* **6**, 32017, doi:10.1038/srep32017  
418 (2016).

419 22 Potapov, P. *et al.* The last frontiers of wilderness: Tracking loss of intact forest landscapes  
420 from 2000 to 2013. *Sc. Adv.* **3**, e1600821, doi:10.1126/sciadv.1600821 (2017).

421 23 Vijay, V., Pimm, S. L., Jenkins, C. N. & Smith, S. J. The Impacts of Oil Palm on Recent  
422 Deforestation and Biodiversity Loss. *PLOS ONE* **11**, e0159668,  
423 doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0159668 (2016).

424 24 Furumo, P. R. & Aide, T. M. Characterizing commercial oil palm expansion in Latin America:  
425 land use change and trade. *Env. Res. Lett.* **12**, 024008, doi:10.1088/1748-9326/aa5892  
426 (2017).

427 25 Austin, K. G., Schwantes, A., Gu, Y. & Kasibhatla, P. S. What causes deforestation in  
428 Indonesia? *Env. Res. Lett.* **14**, 024007, doi:10.1088/1748-9326/aaf6db (2019).

429 26 Gutiérrez-Vélez, V., H. *et al.* High-yield oil palm expansion spares land at the expense of  
430 forests in the Peruvian Amazon. *Env. Res. Lett.* **6**, 044029, doi:10.1088/1748-  
431 9326/6/4/044029 (2011).

432 27 Lee, J. S. H. *et al.* Environmental Impacts of Large-Scale Oil Palm Enterprises Exceed that of  
433 Smallholdings in Indonesia. *Cons. Lett.* **7**, 25-33, doi:10.1111/conl.12039 (2014).

434 28 Schoneveld, G. C., Ekowati, D., Andrianto, A. & van der Haar, S. Modeling peat- and  
435 forestland conversion by oil palm smallholders in Indonesian Borneo. *Env. Res. Lett.* **14**,  
436 014006, doi:10.1088/1748-9326/aaf044 (2019).

437 29 IUCN. The IUCN Red List of Threatened Species. Version 2019-2.  
438 <https://www.iucnredlist.org>. (Gland, Switzerland, 2019).

439 30 Meijaard, E., Abrams, J. F., Juffe-Bignoli, D., Voigt, M. & Sheil, D. Coconut oil, conservation  
440 and the conscientious consumer. *Curr. Biol.* **30**, R757-R758, doi:10.1016/j.cub.2020.05.059  
441 (2020).

442 31 Foster, W. A. *et al.* Establishing the evidence base for maintaining biodiversity and  
443 ecosystem function in the oil palm landscapes of South East Asia. *Phil. Trans Roy. Soc. B: Biol.*  
444 *Sc.* **366**, 3277, doi:10.1098/rstb.2011.0041 (2011).

- 445 32 Savilaakso, S. *et al.* Systematic review of effects on biodiversity from oil palm production.  
446 *Env. Evidence* **3**, 4, doi:10.1186/2047-2382-3-4 (2014).
- 447 33 Germer, J. U. *Spatial undergrowth species composition in oil palm (Elaeis guineensis Jacq.) in*  
448 *West Sumatra*, Kommunikations-, Informations- und Medienzentrum der Universität  
449 Hohenheim, (2003).
- 450 34 Sato, T., Itoh, H., Kudo, G., Kheong, Y. S. & Furukawa, A. Species Composition and Structure  
451 of Epiphytic Fern Community on Oil Palm Trunks in Malay Archipelago. *Tropics* **6**, 139-148,  
452 doi:10.3759/tropics.6.139 (1996).
- 453 35 Letourneau, D. K. *et al.* Does plant diversity benefit agroecosystems? A synthetic review.  
454 *Ecol. Appl.* **21**, 9-21, doi:10.1890/09-2026.1 (2011).
- 455 36 Wearn, O. R., Carbone, C., Rowcliffe, J. M., Bernard, H. & Ewers, R. M. Grain-dependent  
456 responses of mammalian diversity to land use and the implications for conservation set-  
457 aside. *Ecol. Appl.* **26**, 1409-1420, doi:10.1890/15-1363 (2016).
- 458 37 Pardo, L. E. *et al.* Land management strategies can increase oil palm plantation use by some  
459 terrestrial mammals in Colombia. *Scient. Rep.* **9**, 7812, doi:10.1038/s41598-019-44288-y  
460 (2019).
- 461 38 Phalan, B., Onial, M., Balmford, A. & Green, R. E. Reconciling Food Production and  
462 Biodiversity Conservation: Land Sharing and Land Sparing Compared. *Science* **333**, 1289-  
463 1291, doi:10.1126/science.1208742 (2011).
- 464 39 Almeida, S. M. *et al.* The effects of oil palm plantations on the functional diversity of  
465 Amazonian birds. *J. Trop. Ecol.* **32**, 510-525, doi:10.1017/S0266467416000377 (2016).
- 466 40 Edwards, D. P. *et al.* Selective-logging and oil palm: multitaxon impacts, biodiversity  
467 indicators, and trade-offs for conservation planning. *Ecol. Applic.* **24**, 2029-2049,  
468 doi:10.1890/14-0010.1 (2014).
- 469 41 Nájera, A. & Simonetti, J. A. Can oil palm plantations become bird friendly? *Agrofor. Syst.* **80**,  
470 203-209, doi:10.1007/s10457-010-9278-y (2010).
- 471 42 Akani, G. C., Ebere, N., Luiselli, L. & Eniang, E. A. Community structure and ecology of snakes  
472 in fields of oil palm trees (*Elaeis guineensis*) in the Niger Delta, southern Nigeria. *Afr. J. Ecol.*  
473 **46**, 500-506, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2028.2007.00885.x (2008).
- 474 43 Humle, T. & Matsuzawa, T. Oil palm use by adjacent communities of chimpanzees at Bossou  
475 and Nimba Mountains, West Africa. *Int. J. Primatol.* **25**, 551-581,  
476 doi:10.1023/B:IJOP.0000023575.93644.f4 (2004).
- 477 44 Ancrenaz, M. *et al.* Of pongo, palms, and perceptions – A multidisciplinary assessment of  
478 orangutans in an oil palm context. *Oryx* **49**, 465–472, doi:10.1017/S0030605313001270  
479 (2015).
- 480 45 Mitchell, S. L. *et al.* Riparian reserves help protect forest bird communities in oil palm  
481 dominated landscapes. *J. Appl. Ecol.* **55**, 2744-2755, doi:10.1111/1365-2664.13233 (2018).
- 482 46 Deere, N. J. *et al.* Implications of zero-deforestation commitments: Forest quality and  
483 hunting pressure limit mammal persistence in fragmented tropical landscapes. *Cons. Lett.*  
484 **13**, e12701, doi:10.1111/conl.12701 (2020).
- 485 47 Knowlton, J. L. *et al.* Oil palm plantations affect movement behavior of a key member of  
486 mixed-species flocks of forest birds in Amazonia, Brazil. *Trop. Cons. Sc.* **10**,  
487 1940082917692800, doi:10.1177/1940082917692800 (2017).
- 488 48 Tohiran, K. A. *et al.* Targeted cattle grazing as an alternative to herbicides for controlling  
489 weeds in bird-friendly oil palm plantations. *Agron. Sust. Dev.* **37**, 62, doi:10.1007/s13593-  
490 017-0471-5 (2017).
- 491 49 Slade, E. M. *et al.* Can cattle grazing in mature oil palm increase biodiversity and ecosystem  
492 service provision? . *The Planter* **90**, 655-665 (2014).
- 493 50 IUCN. Global Invasive Species Database (GISD). Species profile *Elaeis guineensis*. Available  
494 from: <http://www.iucngisd.org/gisd/species>. [Accessed 27 February 2018]. (2015).

495 51 Wan, H. The introduction of barn owl (*Tyto alba*) to Sabah for rat control in oil palm  
496 plantations. *Planter* **76**, 215-222 (2000).

497 52 Bessou, C. *et al.* *Sustainable Palm Oil Production project synthesis: Understanding and*  
498 *anticipating global challenges*. (Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR), 2017).

499 53 Puan, C. L., Goldizen, A. W., Zakaria, M., Hafidzi, M. N. & Baxter, G. S. Relationships among  
500 rat numbers, abundance of oil palm fruit and damage levels to fruit in an oil palm plantation.  
501 *Intergr. Zool.* **6**, 130-139, doi:10.1111/j.1749-4877.2010.00231.x (2011).

502 54 Holzner, A. *et al.* Macaques can contribute to greener practices in oil palm plantations when  
503 used as biological pest control. *Curr. Biol.* **29**, R1066-R1067, doi:10.1016/j.cub.2019.09.011  
504 (2019).

505 55 Luskin, M. S. *et al.* Cross-boundary subsidy cascades from oil palm degrade distant tropical  
506 forests. *Nature Comms.* **8**, 2231, doi:10.1038/s41467-017-01920-7 (2017).

507 56 Mayfield, M. M. The importance of nearby forest to known and potential pollinators of oil  
508 palm (*Elaeis guineensis* Jacq.; Areceaceae) in southern Costa Rica. *Econ. Botany* **59**, 190,  
509 doi:10.1663/0013-0001(2005)059[0190:TIONFT]2 (2005).

510 57 Woodham, C. R. *et al.* Effects of replanting and retention of mature oil palm riparian buffers  
511 on ecosystem functioning in oil palm plantations. *Front. Forests Glob. Change*,  
512 doi:10.3389/ffgc.2019.00029 (2019).

513 58 Azhar, B. *et al.* The influence of agricultural system, stand structural complexity and  
514 landscape context on foraging birds in oil palm landscapes. *Ibis* **155**, 297-312,  
515 doi:10.1111/ibi.12025 (2013).

516 59 Wijedasa, L. S. *et al.* Denial of long-term issues with agriculture on tropical peatlands will  
517 have devastating consequences. *Glob. Change Biol.* **23**, 977-982, doi:10.1111/gcb.13516  
518 (2016).

519 60 Quezada, J. C., Etter, A., Ghazoul, J., Buttler, A. & Guillaume, T. Carbon neutral expansion of  
520 oil palm plantations in the Neotropics. *Sc. Advan.* **5**, eaaw4418, doi:10.1126/sciadv.aaw4418  
521 (2019).

522 61 Searchinger, T. D., Wiersenius, S., Beringer, T. & Dumas, P. Assessing the efficiency of changes  
523 in land use for mitigating climate change. *Nature* **564**, 249-253, doi:10.1038/s41586-018-  
524 0757-z (2018).

525 62 Reijnders, L. & Huijbregts, M. A. J. Palm oil and the emission of carbon-based greenhouse  
526 gases. *J. Cleaner Prod.* **16**, 477-482, doi:10.1016/j.jclepro.2006.07.054 (2006).

527 63 Murdiyarto, D., Van Noordwijk, M., Wasrin, U. R., Tomich, T. P. & Gillison, A. N.  
528 Environmental benefits and sustainable land-use options in the Jambi transect, Sumatra. *J.*  
529 *Veget. Sc.* **13**, 429-438, doi:10.1111/j.1654-1103.2002.tb02067.x (2002).

530 64 Harsono, S. S., Grundmann, P. & Soebronto, S. Anaerobic treatment of palm oil mill  
531 effluents: potential contribution to net energy yield and reduction of greenhouse gas  
532 emissions from biodiesel production. *J. Cleaner Prod.* **64**, 619-627,  
533 doi:10.1016/j.jclepro.2013.07.056 (2014).

534 65 Hewitt, C. N. *et al.* Nitrogen management is essential to prevent tropical oil palm plantations  
535 from causing ground-level ozone pollution. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sc. USA* **106**, 18447,  
536 doi:10.1073/pnas.0907541106 (2009).

537 66 Misztal, P. K. *et al.* Direct ecosystem fluxes of volatile organic compounds from oil palms in  
538 South-East Asia. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* **11**, 8995-9017, doi:10.5194/acp-11-8995-2011 (2011).

539 67 Guenther, A. *et al.* The Model of Emissions of Gases and Aerosols from Nature version 2.1  
540 (MEGAN2. 1): an extended and updated framework for modeling biogenic emissions.  
541 (2012).

542 68 Ellison, D. *et al.* Trees, forests and water: Cool insights for a hot world. *Glob. Env. Change* **43**,  
543 51-61, doi:10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2017.01.002 (2017).

544 69 McAlpine, C. A. *et al.* Forest loss and Borneo's climate. *Env. Res. Lett.* **13**, 044009,  
545 doi:10.1088/1748-9326/aaa4ff (2018).

546 70 Fan, Y. *et al.* Reconciling canopy interception parameterization and rainfall forcing frequency  
547 in the community land model for simulating evapotranspiration of rainforests and oil palm  
548 plantations in Indonesia. *J. Advan. Model. Earth Syst.* **11**, 732-751,  
549 doi:10.1029/2018MS001490 (2019).

550 71 Crippa, P. *et al.* Population exposure to hazardous air quality due to the 2015 fires in  
551 Equatorial Asia. *Sci. Rep.* **6**, 37074, doi:10.1038/srep37074 (2016).

552 72 Nichol, J. Bioclimatic impacts of the 1994 smoke haze event in Southeast Asia. *Atmosph. Env.*  
553 **31**, 1209-1219, doi:10.1016/S1352-2310(96)00260-9 (1997).

554 73 Carlson, K. M. *et al.* Consistent results in stream hydrology across multiple watersheds: A  
555 reply to Chew and Goh. *J. Geophys. Res. Biogeosci.* **120**, 812-817,  
556 doi:10.1002/2014JG002834 (2015).

557 74 Luke, S. H. *et al.* The effects of catchment and riparian forest quality on stream  
558 environmental conditions across a tropical rainforest and oil palm landscape in Malaysian  
559 Borneo. *Ecohydrol.* **10**, e1827, doi:10.1002/eco.1827 (2017).

560 75 Mayer, P. M., Reynolds, S. K., McCutchen, M. D. & Canfield, T. J. Meta-Analysis of Nitrogen  
561 Removal in Riparian Buffers. *J. Env. Qual.* **36**, 1172-1180, doi:10.2134/jeq2006.0462 (2007).

562 76 Chellaiah, D. & Yule, C. M. Effect of riparian management on stream morphometry and  
563 water quality in oil palm plantations in Borneo. *Limnologica* **69**, 72-80,  
564 doi:10.1016/j.limno.2017.11.007 (2018).

565 77 Sulai, P. *et al.* Effects of water quality in oil palm production landscapes on tropical  
566 waterbirds in Peninsular Malaysia. *Ecol. Res.* **30**, 941-949, doi:10.1007/s11284-015-1297-8  
567 (2015).

568 78 Anda, M., Siswanto, A. B. & Subandiono, R. E. Properties of organic and acid sulfate soils and  
569 water of a 'reclaimed' tidal backswamp in Central Kalimantan, Indonesia. *Geoderma* **149**, 54-  
570 65, doi:10.1016/j.geoderma.2008.11.021 (2009).

571 79 Luke, S. H. *et al.* Riparian buffers in tropical agriculture: Scientific support, effectiveness and  
572 directions for policy. *J. Appl. Ecol.* **56**, 85-92, doi:10.1111/1365-2664.13280 (2019).

573 80 Wich, Serge A. *et al.* Will Oil Palm's Homecoming Spell Doom for Africa's Great Apes? *Curr.*  
574 *Biol.* **24**, 1659-1663, doi:10.1016/j.cub.2014.05.077 (2014).

575 81 Sayer, J., Ghazoul, J., Nelson, P. & Boedhihartono, A. K. Oil palm expansion transforms  
576 tropical landscapes and livelihoods. *Glob. Food Secur.* **1**, 114-119,  
577 doi:10.1016/j.gfs.2012.10.003 (2012).

578 82 RSPO. RSPO and HCSA Collaborate to Implement No Deforestation in High Forest Cover  
579 Landscapes. [https://rspo.org/news-and-events/news/rspo-and-hcsa-collaborate-to-](https://rspo.org/news-and-events/news/rspo-and-hcsa-collaborate-to-implement-no-deforestation-in-high-forest-cover-landscapes)  
580 [implement-no-deforestation-in-high-forest-cover-landscapes](https://rspo.org/news-and-events/news/rspo-and-hcsa-collaborate-to-implement-no-deforestation-in-high-forest-cover-landscapes). (2018).

581 83 Law, E. A. *et al.* Mixed policies give more options in multifunctional tropical forest  
582 landscapes. *J. Appl. Ecol.* **54**, 51-60, doi:10.1111/1365-2664.12666 (2017).

583 84 Budiadi *et al.* Oil palm agroforestry: an alternative to enhance farmers' livelihood resilience.  
584 *IOP Conf. Ser.: Earth Env. Sc.* **336**, 012001, doi:10.1088/1755-1315/336/1/012001 (2019).

585 85 Valin, H. *et al.* The land use change impact of biofuels consumed in the EU. Quantification of  
586 area and greenhouse gas impacts. (ECOFYS Netherlands B.V., Utrecht, the Netherlands,  
587 2015).

588 86 Thamsiroj, T. & Murphy, J. D. Is it better to import palm oil from Thailand to produce  
589 biodiesel in Ireland than to produce biodiesel from indigenous Irish rape seed? *Appl. Energy*  
590 **86**, 595-604, doi:10.1016/j.apenergy.2008.07.010 (2009).

591 87 Rosoman, G., Sheun, S. S., Opal, C., Anderson, P. & Trapshah, R. The HCS Approach Toolkit.  
592 (HCS Approach Steering Group, Singapore, 2017).

593 88 Carlson, K. M. *et al.* Effect of oil palm sustainability certification on deforestation and fire in  
594 Indonesia. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **115**, 121-126, doi:10.1073/pnas.1704728114 (2018).

595 89 Furumo, P. R., Rueda, X., Rodríguez, J. S. & Parés Ramos, I. K. Field evidence for positive  
596 certification outcomes on oil palm smallholder management practices in Colombia. *J.*  
597 *Cleaner Prod.* **245**, 118891, doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118891> (2020).

598 90 Donofrio, S., Rothrock, P. & Leonard, J. Tracking Corporate Commitments to Deforestation-  
599 free Supply Chains, 2017. (Forest Trends, Washington, DC, 2017).

600 91 SPOTT. Palm oil: ESG policy transparency assessments. <https://www.spott.org/palm-oil/>.  
601 (2018).

602 92 Furumo, P. R. & Lambin, E. F. Scaling up zero-deforestation initiatives through public-private  
603 partnerships: A look inside post-conflict Colombia. **62**, 102055,  
604 doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2020.102055> (2020).

605 93 Gibbs, H. K. *et al.* Brazil's Soy Moratorium. *Science* **347**, 377, doi:10.1126/science.aaa0181  
606 (2015).

607 94 OECD and FAO. OECD-FAO Agricultural Outlook 2018-2027. (2017).

608 95 Parsons, S., Raikova, S. & Chuck, C. J. The viability and desirability of replacing palm oil. *Nat.*  
609 *Sust.* **3**, 412-418, doi:10.1038/s41893-020-0487-8 (2020).

610 96 Qaim, M., Sibhatu, K. T., Siregar, H. & Grass, I. Environmental, Economic, and Social  
611 Consequences of the Oil Palm Boom. *Ann. Rev.* **12**, 321-344, doi:10.1146/annurev-resource-  
612 110119-024922 (2020).

613 97 VanBeek, K. R., Brawn, J. D. & Ward, M. P. Does no-till soybean farming provide any benefits  
614 for birds? *Agric. Ecosyst. Env.* **185**, 59-64, doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2013.12.007>  
615 (2014).

616 98 Green, J. M. H. *et al.* Linking global drivers of agricultural trade to on-the-ground impacts on  
617 biodiversity. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **116**, 23202, doi:10.1073/pnas.1905618116 (2019).

618 99 Strona, G. *et al.* Small room for compromise between oil palm cultivation and primate  
619 conservation in Africa. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **115**, 8811, doi:10.1073/pnas.1804775115  
620 (2018).

621 100 Ajjawi, I. *et al.* Lipid production in *Nannochloropsis gaditana* is doubled by decreasing  
622 expression of a single transcriptional regulator. *Nature Biotech.* **35**, 647,  
623 doi:10.1038/nbt.3865 (2017).

624 101 De Beenhouwer, M., Aerts, R. & Honnay, O. A global meta-analysis of the biodiversity and  
625 ecosystem service benefits of coffee and cacao agroforestry. *Agric. Ecosyst. Env.* **175**, 1-7,  
626 doi:10.1016/j.agee.2013.05.003 (2013).

627 102 Strassburg, B. B. N. *et al.* Global priority areas for ecosystem restoration. *Nature*,  
628 doi:10.1038/s41586-020-2784-9 (2020).

629 103 Payán, E. & Boron, V. The Future of Wild Mammals in Oil Palm Landscapes in the Neotropics.  
630 *Front. Forests Glob. Change* **2**, doi:10.3389/ffgc.2019.00061 (2019).

631 104 Maddox, T., Priatna, D., Gemita, E. & Salampessy, A. The conservation of tigers and other  
632 wildlife in oil palm plantations Jambi Province, Sumatra, Indonesia. ZSL Conservation Report  
633 No.7. (The Zoological Society of London, London, UK, 2007).

634 105 Ancrenaz, M. *et al.* *Pongo pygmaeus*. *IUCN Red List Threat. Sp.*, e.T17975A17966347 (2016).

635 106 Pangau-Adam, M., Mühlenberg, M. & Waltert, M. Rainforest disturbance affects population  
636 density of the northern cassowary *Casuaris unappendiculatus* in Papua, Indonesia. *Oryx* **49**,  
637 735-742, doi:10.1017/S0030605313001464 (2014).

638 107 Alamgir, M. *et al.* Infrastructure expansion challenges sustainable development in Papua  
639 New Guinea. *PLOS ONE* **14**, e0219408, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0219408 (2019).

640 108 Katiyar, R. *et al.* Microalgae: An emerging source of energy based bio-products and a  
641 solution for environmental issues. *Renew. Sust. Energy Rev.* **72**, 1083-1093,  
642 doi:10.1016/j.rser.2016.10.028 (2017).

643 109 Nomanbhay, S., Salman, B., Hussain, R. & Ong, M. Y. Microwave pyrolysis of lignocellulosic  
644 biomass—a contribution to power Africa. *Energy Sust. Soc.* **7**, 23, doi:10.1186/s13705-017-  
645 0126-z (2017).  
646

647 Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to emeijaard@gmail.com.

648 **Acknowledgements** The development of this situation analysis was supported by the IUCN project  
649 “Global Commons: Solutions for a Crowded Planet”, funded by the Global Environment Facility. DJB  
650 received funding from the UK Research and Innovation’s Global Challenges Research Fund under the  
651 Trade, Development and the Environment Hub project (project number ES/S008160/1). MP was  
652 supported by the CNPq research productivity fellowships (#308403/2017-7). JGU was funded by  
653 SNSF R4D-project Oil Palm Adaptive Landscapes.

654

#### 655 **Author contributions**

656 EM, DS, and TB conceptualized this study and developed the initial manuscript, with KC, JGU, DG,  
657 JSHL, DJB, SAW, MA, SW, LPK, JFA, ZS and AD assisting in the acquisition, analysis, and interpretation  
658 of the data and further writing. ES, TS, JA, HP, CS, DM, PF, NM, RH, MP, and MS provided substantial  
659 input into the text revisions, and NZ, JA, DJB, KC, DG, AD and JFA designed the graphics.

660

#### 661 **Competing Interests statement**

662 None of co-authors in this study, except DJB, MP, and JGU, received funding for conducting this  
663 review, although the information was partly based on a study funded by the Global Environment  
664 Facility. EM, TB, DG, MA, SW, LPK, JGU, KC, NM and DS are members of and have received funding  
665 from the IUCN Oil Palm Task Force, a group tasked by the IUCN members to investigate the  
666 sustainability of palm oil. TB, DJB, MA, CS and NM work for conservation organizations and EM, MA  
667 and MP have done work paid by palm oil companies or the Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil.

668 **FIGURE LEGENDS**

669

670 **Figure 1. Main vegetable oil crops (see Table 1). (a) Harvested area from 1961 to 2017. (b)**

671 **Vegetable oil production from 1961 to 2014. Data from FAOSTAT<sup>4</sup>.**

672

673 **Figure 2. Maps of industrial and smallholder-scale oil palm from analysis of satellite imagery until**

674 **the second half of 2019<sup>3</sup>, and examples of species it affects negatively: (a) *Panthera onca* (Near**

675 **Threatened)<sup>103</sup> and *Ara macao* (Least Concern)<sup>39</sup>; (b) *Pan troglodytes* (Endangered)<sup>80</sup>; (c) *Panthera***

676 ***tigris* (Endangered)<sup>104</sup>, *Helarctos malayanus* (Vulnerable)<sup>104</sup>, *Pongo pygmaeus* (Critically**

677 **Endangered)<sup>105</sup>, *Casuarius unappendiculatus* (Least Concern)<sup>106</sup>, and *Dendrolagus goodfellowi***

678 **(Endangered)<sup>107</sup>. The maps lack information on plantations < 3 years old and planted oil palm in**

679 **mixed agroforestry settings, but provide the most up-to-date estimates available. For each region**

680 **the percentages of intact (green) and non-intact forests (orange) are shown relative to the total**

681 **extent of forest ecosystems<sup>22</sup>.**

682

683 **Figure 3. Oil palm's estimated role in deforestation aggregated across studies, years, and regions.**

684 **Panel a depicts the contribution of oil palm to overall deforestation, while b shows the percentage**

685 **of all oil palm expansion that cleared forest (Supplementary Methods). There were no data for**

686 **Peru and South and Central America for panel a, and no global data for panel b. Southeast Asia (SE**

687 **Asia) excludes Indonesia and Malaysia, which are shown separately, while South America excludes**

688 **Peru. Each filled circle represents one time period from a single study, with individual studies**

689 **represented by distinct colours. The size of the circle corresponds to the relative number of area-**

690 **years represented in that time period (larger circles represent a larger study area and longer time**

691 **period of sampling). Boxplot middle bars correspond to the unweighted median across study-time**



692 periods; lower and upper hinges represent the 25<sup>th</sup> and 75<sup>th</sup> percentiles of study-time periods; and  
693 whiskers extend from the upper (lower) hinge to the largest (smallest) value no further than 1.5  
694 times the interquartile range from the hinge (Figure S2, Tables S2 and S3).

695

696 **Figure 4 - Species groups with more than 8 threatened species with the terms "palm oil" or "oil**  
697 **palm" in the threats texts of the IUCN Red List of Threatened Species Assessments<sup>29</sup>. In total 321**  
698 **species assessments had oil palm plantations as one of the reported threats (301 when excluding**  
699 **groups with < 8 threatened species), which constitutes 3.5% of threatened species threatened by**  
700 **annual and perennial non-timber crops (9,088 species) and 1.2% of all globally threatened species**  
701 **(27,159 species) in 2019 (Supplementary Material and Table S4). CR = Critically Endangered; EN =**  
702 **Endangered; VU = Vulnerable.**

703

704

705

706 **Table 1. Overview of the major oil crops, typical production cycle, yields, main production**  
707 **countries, biomes in which impacts primarily occur, carbon emissions, the number of threatened**  
708 **species according to the IUCN Red List of Threatened Species<sup>29</sup> for which the specific crop is**  
709 **mentioned as a threat, and the median species richness and median range-size rarity (amphibians,**  
710 **birds and mammals) of species occurring within the footprint of each crop with first and third**  
711 **quartile in brackets (IUCN Red List) (see Supporting Online Methods, Figure S1, Table S4). Carbon**  
712 **emissions include carbon opportunity costs and production emissions<sup>61</sup>. “n/a” indicates that no**  
713 **data are available.**

Oil crop	Type of crop	Oil yield (t ha <sup>-1</sup> ) 108,109	Main oil production countries	Main biome impacted	Kg CO2e/MJ <sup>61</sup>	# species threatened by crop <sup>29</sup>	Median Species Richness (number of species) <sup>29</sup>	Median range-size rarity (ha ha <sup>-1</sup> 10e5) <sup>29</sup>
Oil palm <i>Elaeis guineensis</i>	Perennial (25 years cycle)	1.9–4.8	Indonesia, Malaysia, Thailand	Tropical rainforest	1.2	321	472 [443, 504]	36 [27, 57]
Soybean <i>Glycine max</i>	Annual (~6 months cycle), rotated with other crops	0.4–0.8	China, USA, Brazil, Argentina	Subtropical grass savanna, temperate steppe, and broadleaf forest	1.3	73	278 [251, 462]	10 [5, 14]
Rapeseed <i>Brassica napus</i> and <i>B. campestris</i>	Annual (~6 months cycle). Rotated with other crops	0.7–1.8	China, Germany, Canada	Temperate steppe and broadleaf forest and taiga	1.2	1	227 [187, 308]	4 [3, 10]
Cotton <i>Gossypium hirsutum</i>	Annual (~6 months cycle). Rotated with other crops	0.3–0.4	China, India	Subtropical monsoon, dry and humid forest and temperate areas	1.2	35	299 [234, 347]	10 [7, 12]
Groundnuts or peanuts <i>Arachis</i>	Annual (4-5 months crop cycle).	0.5–0.8	China, India	Subtropical monsoon, dry and humid forest and	1.5	6	351 [308, 426]	11 [7, 16]

<i>hypogaea</i>	Rotated with other crops			temperate areas				
Sunflower <i>Helianthus annuus</i>	Annual (3-4 months crop cycle). Rotated with other crops	0.5–0.9	Ukraine, Russia	Temperate steppe and broadleaf forest	1.0	1	189 [177, 222]	3 [2, 9]
Coconut <i>Cocos nucifera</i>	Perennial (30 – 50 y cycle)	0.4–2.4	Philippines, Indonesia, India	Tropical and subtropical forest	n/a	65	317 [264, 414]	73 [35, 113]
Maize <i>Zea mays</i>	Annual (5-6 months crop cycle). Rotated with other crops	0.1–0.2	USA, China,	Temperate steppe and broadleaf forest	0.7	131	273 [222, 427]	9 [5, 20]
Olive <i>Olea europaea</i>	Perennial, long lived. Sometimes inter-cropped	0.3–2.9	Spain, Italy, Greece	Mediterranean vegetation	n/a	14	n/a	n/a

714







